

1 EDELSBERG LAW, P.A.
2 Scott Edelsberg (SBN 330990)
3 scott@edelsberglaw.com
4 1925 Century Park E #1700
5 Los Angeles, California 90067
6 Telephone: (310) 438-5355

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Proposed
8 Classes*

9 *(Additional Attorneys Listed on
10 Signature Page)*

11 Kevin Minnick (SBN: 269620)
12 kminnick@spertuslaw.com
13 Spertus Landes & Josephs LLP
14 617 West 7th Street, Suite 200
15 Los Angeles, CA 90017
16 Tele No.: (213) 205-6520
17 Fax No.: (213) 205-521

18 BOWMAN AND BROOKE LLP
19 Vincent Galvin (SBN: 104448)
20 Vincent.galvin@bowmanandbrooke.com
21 Lauren O. Miller (SBN: 279448)
22 Lauren.Miller@bowmanandbrooke.com
23 1741 Technology Drive, Suite 200
24 San Jose, California 95110
25 Tel No.: (408) 279-5393
26 Fax No.: (408) 279-5845

27 *Attorneys for Defendant
28 Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc.*

12 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
13 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – WESTERN DIVISION**

14 ELLIOT NAZOS, CHRISTINE
15 BLIGHT, JEFFREY COCHRAN,
16 JACK PERRY, BRIAN AND
17 BARBARA SAUNDERS, PATRICIA
18 LOUGHNEY, EMILY BARBOUR,
19 THOMAS PASTORE, TIMOTHY
20 AND DAWN DOTSON, JILL
21 SILVERNALE and KYLE BLUMIN,
22 individually and on behalf of all others
23 similarly situated,

24 Plaintiffs,

25 v.

26 TOYOTA MOTOR SALES, U.S.A.,
27 INC.,

28 Defendant.

Case No. 2:22-cv-02214-PA(Ex)

STIPULATED AND
PROTECTIVE ORDER
CONCERNING CONFIDENTIAL
TREATMENT OF DISCOVERY
MATERIALS

Assigned to: Hon. Percy Anderson

1 Plaintiffs and Defendant Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc. (“Toyota”)
2 (collectively, “Parties”), by and through their respective counsel, and pursuant to Rule
3 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, hereby stipulate and agree to the terms
4 of this Stipulated Protective Order Regarding Confidential Treatment of Discovery
5 Materials (hereinafter “Stipulated Protective Order”) as follows:

6 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, subject to the approval of the Court that:

7 1. In connection with discovery proceedings in this Action, the Parties may
8 designate any document, thing, material, discovery responses, depositions, deposition
9 exhibits, testimony or other information derived therefrom, including notes, lists,
10 memoranda, indices, compilations, or other materials prepared or based on an
11 examination of such information or materials (hereinafter “Discovery Materials”), as
12 “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” under the terms of this Protective Order
13 (hereinafter “Order”) if the Producing Party in good faith reasonably believes that such
14 Discovery Materials contain non-public, confidential, personal, proprietary, or
15 commercially sensitive information that requires protections provided in this Order.
16 Confidential Material and Highly Confidential Material are collectively defined as
17 “Covered Information.”

18 a) For purposes of this Order, information considered to be “Confidential
19 Material” includes any information that a Party believes in good faith to
20 be confidential or sensitive non-public information, including but not
21 limited to, research, design, development, financial, technical, marketing
22 or planning, personal, or commercial information, as such terms are used
23 in Rule 26(c)(1)(G) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any
24 applicable case law interpreting Rule 26(c)(1)(G), as well the following
25 categories of sensitive personal information of individuals:

26 i. Social Security Number, name, address, telephone number,
27 personal email address, drivers’ license number, date of birth,

Vehicle Identification Number (VIN), financial account numbers, credit card numbers, bank routing numbers, license plate number, police report numbers, insurance claim numbers, and/or towing claim numbers.

b) For purposes of this Order, “Highly Confidential Material” shall include, but is not limited to Confidential Material as defined herein, which also includes non-public product design and testing information or extremely sensitive, highly confidential, non-public information, consisting either of trade secrets or proprietary or other highly confidential business, financial, regulatory, or strategic information (including information regarding business plans, technical data, and non-public designs), the disclosure of which would create a substantial risk of competitive or business injury to the Producing Party. Certain information may compel alternative or additional protections beyond those afforded Highly Confidential Material, in which event the Parties shall meet and confer in good faith, and, if unsuccessful, shall move the Court for appropriate relief.

2. Covered Information shall be so designated by stamping copies of the document produced to a Party with the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” Stamping the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” on the cover of any multipage documents shall designate all pages of the document as confidential, unless otherwise indicated by the Producing Party. With respect to documents or materials containing Covered Information produced in Native Format, the Producing Party shall include the highest level of confidentiality designation in the filename and the accompanying production slip sheet.

3. Testimony taken at a deposition may be designated as Confidential Material by making a statement to that effect on the record at the deposition or by serving such designations within 30 days after receipt of the transcript of the deposition

1 in which the designations are made. All deposition transcripts shall be treated as Highly
2 Confidential for 30 days following receipt of the transcript. Arrangements shall be
3 made with the court reporter taking and transcribing such deposition to separately bind
4 such portions of the transcript containing information designated as Confidential
5 Material or Highly Confidential Material, and to label such portions appropriately.

6 4. Discovery Materials designated as Confidential Material under this Order,
7 the information contained therein, and any summaries, copies, abstracts, or other
8 documents derived in whole or in part from such Confidential Material shall be used
9 only for the purpose of the prosecution, defense, or settlement of this Action, and for
10 no other purpose.

11 5. All references to “Party,” “Receiving Party,” or “Producing Party” as used
12 throughout this Order are intended to include non-parties. Any Party issuing a
13 subpoena to a non-party shall enclose a copy of this Protective Order with a request
14 that, within 14 days, the non-party either request the protection of this Protective Order
15 or notify the issuing Party that the non-party does not need the protection of this
16 Protective Order or wishes to seek different protection.

17 6. Confidential Material produced pursuant to this Order may be disclosed
18 or made available only to the Court, to counsel for a Party (including the clerks,
19 employees, paralegals, assistants, secretaries, staff and stenographic, computer, audio-
20 visual and clerical employees and agents thereof when operating under the supervision
21 of such counsel), and to the “qualified persons” designated below:

- 22 a) a Party, or an officer, director, or employee of a Party deemed necessary
23 by counsel to aid in the prosecution, defense, or settlement of this Action;
24 b) individual experts, consultants, or expert consulting firm (together with
25 their clerical staff) retained by counsel of record in this Action to assist in
26 the prosecution, defense, or settlement of this Action to the extent
27 necessary for the individual expert, consultant, or expert consulting firm

1 to prepare a written opinion, to prepare to testify, or to assist counsel of
2 record in the prosecution or defense of this Action, provided, however,
3 that: (i) the disclosure shall be made only to an individual expert, or to
4 members, partners, employees, or agents of an expert consulting firm as
5 the expert consulting firm shall designate as the persons who will
6 undertake the engagement on behalf of the expert consulting firm (the
7 “Designated Expert Personnel”); (ii) the individual expert or Designated
8 Expert Personnel use the information solely in connection with this
9 Action; (iii) the individual and/or a representative of each expert
10 consulting firm sign the written assurance attached as Attachment A on
11 behalf of any Designated Expert Personnel associated with that firm; and
12 (iv) absent notice and consent of Toyota, the individual expert and each
13 of the Designated Expert Personnel is not a current or former (within the
14 past three years from the date of this Order) employee of any party or any
15 entity which directly competes with, or is a direct seller to, the Defendant;¹
16 c) court reporter(s), stenographers, outside copying services, or companies
17 engaged in the business of supporting computerized or electronic
18 litigation discovery or trial preparation, retained by a Party or its counsel
19 employed in this Action;
20 d) a witness at any deposition or other proceeding in this Action;
21 e) any person (i) who created, authored, received, or reviewed such
22 Confidential Material; (ii) is or was a custodian of the Confidential
23 Material; (iii) is identified on such Confidential Material; or (iv) is or was
24 an employee of the Producing Party and is reasonably believed to have
25 knowledge of the matters in the Confidential Material; and

26
27 ¹ Retention in this Action shall not qualify a potential expert as an employee of a party
28 or any entity which directly competes with, or is a direct seller to, the Defendant.

1 f) any other person as to whom the Parties in writing agree.

2 Prior to receiving any Confidential Material, each “qualified person”—except those
3 listed in Paragraph 6(e) above—shall be provided with a copy of this Order and shall
4 execute a nondisclosure agreement in the form of Attachment A, a copy of which shall
5 be retained by counsel for the Party sharing Confidential Material. In the event a
6 witness under Paragraph 6(d) refuses to sign Attachment A, he or she may be shown
7 Confidential Material at a deposition or other proceeding only after, on the record of
8 the deposition: stating such refusal, being advised that the following Order applies to
9 him or her, and being read the following: “By order of the Court in this Action, you
10 may not disclose in any manner any Confidential Material to any person or entity
11 except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order, and if you do so, you may
12 be subject to sanctions and punishment by the Court.” Counsel for the Party sharing
13 Confidential Material shall also retain a list of Confidential Material shared with any
14 “qualified person” listed under Paragraphs 6(a), (b), (d), and (f).

15 7. Except as specifically provided for in this or subsequent Court orders,
16 Highly Confidential Material or their contents may be disclosed, summarized,
17 described, or otherwise communicated or made available in whole or in part, only to
18 the Court, to counsel for a Party (including the clerks, employees, paralegals, assistants,
19 secretaries, staff and stenographic, computer, audio-visual and clerical employees and
20 agents thereof when operating under the supervision of such counsel), and to the
21 persons identified and conditions set forth in Paragraphs 6(b), (c), (e), and (f), and:

22 a) A Plaintiff, but only if the Highly Confidential Material is included in a
23 Court filing, hearing, or deposition (or if Plaintiffs’ Counsel otherwise
24 seek permission to disclose the material to the Plaintiffs), and if the
25 Producing Party has not objected to the disclosure within 7 days of the
26 Court filing, hearing, deposition, or request to disclose. Plaintiffs’
27 Counsel shall have the right to seek Court intervention to resolve
28 objections as to this provision. This provision has no effect on a Party’s

obligation to file Covered Information under seal, as set forth in Paragraph 14 below.

- b) Members of the in-house legal departments for the Parties or their parents or affiliates, including their paralegals, investigative, technical, secretarial, and clerical personnel who are engaged in assisting them in this Litigation; or
 - c) Any person who (1) (a) created, authored, received, or reviewed such Highly Confidential Material, (b) is or was a custodian of the Highly Confidential Material, or (c) is identified on such Highly Confidential Material; and (2) has signed Attachment A as described in Paragraph 6.

8. Only qualified persons may attend depositions at which Confidential Material is used or discussed.

9. A Party objecting to the designation of any material as Confidential or Highly Confidential shall do so in good faith, and shall give written notice to the Designating Party, identifying the documents subject to the objection by Bates number and the basis for the objection to each such document. Upon receipt of the written objection, counsel for the Designating Party shall, within 14 days, provide a written response to the objecting Party explaining the basis for the designation. The Parties shall meet and confer in good faith to attempt to resolve the dispute without resort to Court intervention. If the objecting Party and the Designating Party cannot resolve their dispute through such meet and confer discussions, within 21 days after the Parties have reached an impasse after meet and confer efforts, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality pursuant to the Local Rules. The Designating Party has the burden of establishing that the document is entitled to protection. Any material so designated shall remain Confidential or Highly Confidential, and shall be subject to all of the restrictions on its disclosure and use set forth in this Order until such time as the Court may determine otherwise. In the event the Court rules that the challenged material is not Confidential or Highly Confidential, the Designating Party

1 shall reproduce copies of all materials so designated without Confidential or Highly
2 Confidential label within 14 days.

3 10. If at any time prior to the trial of this Action a Party realizes that
4 previously produced Discovery Material should be designated as “Confidential” or
5 “Highly Confidential,” the Party may so designate by advising all other Parties in
6 writing and by producing replacement documents or material with the appropriate
7 “Confidential” or “Highly Confidential” designation as described above. The
8 designated documents or material will thereafter be treated as “Confidential” or
9 “Highly Confidential” pursuant to this Order. Upon receipt of such designation in
10 writing and re-production of the material with the “Confidential” or “Highly
11 Confidential” stamp, the Parties and other persons subject to this Order shall take
12 reasonable and appropriate steps to notify any and all recipients of the Discovery
13 Material about the protected status of the newly designated “Confidential” or “Highly
14 Confidential” Materials, and to retrieve the newly designated “Confidential” or
15 “Highly Confidential” Materials from any person who is not permitted by this Order
16 to have the Covered Information.

17 11. No Party receiving Covered Information shall be under any obligation to
18 object to the designation of any document at the time such designation is made or at
19 any time thereafter. No Party shall, by failure to object, be found to have acquiesced or
20 agreed to such designation or be barred from objecting to such designation at any time.

21 12. The failure to designate Discovery Material does not constitute a waiver
22 of such claim and may be remedied by prompt supplemental written notice upon
23 discovery of the disclosure, with the effect that such Discovery Material will be subject
24 to the protections of this Order. The Receiving Party shall exercise good faith efforts
25 to ensure that copies made of Covered Information produced to it, and copies made by
26 others who obtained such Covered Information directly or indirectly from the
27 Receiving Party, include the appropriate confidentiality legend, to the same extent that

1 the Covered Information has been marked with the appropriate confidentiality legend
2 by the Producing Party.

3 13. Nothing herein shall impose any restrictions on the use or disclosure by a
4 party of material obtained by such party independent of discovery in this Action,
5 whether or not such material is also obtained through discovery in this Action, or from
6 disclosing its own Covered Information as it deems appropriate.

7 14. If Covered Information, including any portion of a deposition transcript
8 designated as Confidential or Highly Confidential, is included in any papers to be filed
9 with the Court, such papers shall be accompanied by an application to (a) file the
10 confidential portions thereof under seal (if such portions are segregable), or (b) file the
11 papers in their entirety under seal (if the confidential portions are not segregable). The
12 application shall be directed to the judge to whom the papers are directed. Pending the
13 ruling on the application, the papers or portions thereof subject to the sealing
14 application shall be lodged under seal.

15 15. If any Party has obtained Covered Information under the terms of this
16 Order and receives a request to produce such Covered Information by subpoena or
17 other compulsory process commanding the production of such Covered Information,
18 such Party shall promptly notify the Designating Party, including in such notice the
19 date set for the production of such subpoenaed information. Such notification shall
20 include a copy of the subpoena or other order. The Party on which the subpoena or
21 other order was served shall promptly notify in writing the party/person/entity who
22 caused the subpoena or other order to issue that some or all of the material covered by
23 the subpoena or other order is subject to this Order, and shall cooperate with respect to
24 all reasonable procedures sought or pursued by the Producing Party whose Confidential
25 or Highly Confidential Materials may be affected.

26 16. This Order shall be without prejudice to the right of the Parties (i) to bring
27 before the Court at any time the question of whether any particular document or
28

1 information is confidential or whether its use should be restricted or (ii) to present a
2 motion to the Court under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c) for a separate protective order as to any
3 particular document or information, including restrictions differing from those as
4 specified herein.

5 17. This Order is entered solely for the purpose of facilitating the exchange
6 of documents and information between the Parties to this Action without involving the
7 Court unnecessarily in the process. Nothing in this Order nor the production of any
8 information or document under the terms of this Order nor any proceedings pursuant
9 to this Order shall be deemed to have the effect of an admission or waiver by either
10 Party or of altering the confidentiality or nonconfidentiality of any such document or
11 information or altering any existing obligation of any party or the absence thereof.

12 18. Any person in possession of another Party's Covered Information shall
13 exercise the same care with regard to the storage, custody, or use of Covered
14 Information as they would apply to their own material of the same or comparable
15 sensitivity. Receiving Parties must take reasonable precautions to protect Covered
16 Information from loss, misuse and unauthorized access, disclosure, alteration, and
17 destruction, including but not limited to:

- 18 a) Covered Information in electronic format shall be maintained in a secure
19 litigation support site(s) that applies standard industry practices regarding
20 data security, including but not limited to application of access control
21 rights to those persons entitled to access Covered Information under this
22 Order;
- 23 b) An audit trail of use and access to litigation support site(s) shall be
24 maintained while this Litigation, including any appeals, is pending,
25 provided it can be generated in the ordinary course of business;
- 26 c) Any Covered Information downloaded from the litigation support site(s)
27 in electronic format shall be stored only on device(s) (e.g., laptop, tablet,
28 smartphone, thumb drive, portable hard drive) that are password protected

1 and/or encrypted with access limited to persons entitled to access Covered
2 Information under this Order. If the user is unable to password protect
3 and/or encrypt the device, then the Covered Information shall be password
4 protected and/or encrypted at the file level;

- 5 d) The Receiving Party should take reasonable steps to maintain Covered
6 Information in paper format in a private location with access limited to
7 persons entitled to access Covered Information under this Order; and
8 e) Summaries of Covered Information, including any lists, memorandum,
9 indices, or compilations prepared or based on an examination of Covered
10 Information, that quote from or paraphrase Covered Information in a
11 manner that enables it to be identified shall be accorded the same status
12 of confidentiality as the underlying Covered Information;
13 f) If the recipient of Covered Information is shipping data in electronic
14 format, the recipient shall encrypt the data prior to shipping and provide
15 the encryption key in separate correspondence. If hard copy documents
16 are shipped, the Receiving Party will ship the documents using secure
17 packaging tape via Federal Express or UPS and retain a tracking number
18 for the materials. If the Receiving Party learns at any time that the Covered
19 Information has been retrieved or viewed by unauthorized parties during
20 shipment, it will immediately notify the Producing Party and take all
21 reasonable measures to retrieve the improperly disclosed materials;
22 g) If the Receiving Party discovers a breach of security² relating to the
23 Covered Information of a Producing Party, the Receiving Party shall: (1)
24 provide written notice to the Producing Party of the breach within 48

25 _____
26 ² Breach is defined to include, but is not limited to, the confirmed or suspected: (i)
27 disclosure or use of Covered Information by or to an unauthorized person or by an
authorized person in an unauthorized manner; and/or (ii) the loss, theft, or hacking of
a device containing Covered Information.

hours of the Receiving Party's discovery of the breach; (2) investigate and remediate the effects of the breach, and take reasonable and appropriate steps to make sure the breach shall not recur; and (3) provide sufficient information about the breach that the Producing Party can ascertain the size and scope of the breach as it concerns the Covered Information produced in this litigation. The Receiving Party agrees to cooperate with the Producing Party or law enforcement in investigating any such security incident. Nothing in this provision requires a Receiving Party to breach attorney-client privilege or waive attorney work-product or any other applicable privilege or protection.

19. This Order shall survive the final termination of this Action, to the extent
11 that the information contained in Confidential or Highly Confidential Material is not
12 or does not become known to the public, and the Court shall retain jurisdiction to
13 resolve any dispute concerning the use of information disclosed hereunder. Upon
14 termination of this Action, counsel for the Parties shall assemble and return to each
15 other all documents, material, and deposition transcripts designated as Confidential or
16 Highly Confidential Material and all copies of same, or shall certify the destruction
17 thereof. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel may retain all pleadings, motion
18 papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence,
19 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, and other documents filed with the Court
20 that refer to or incorporate Covered Information, provided that any such archival copies
21 that contain or constitute Covered Information remain subject to this Protective Order.
22 Further, attorney work-product materials that contain Covered Information need not be
23 destroyed, but, if they are not destroyed, the person in possession of the attorney work-
24 product will continue to be bound by this Order with respect to all such retained
25 information.

26
27 20. Nothing in this Order shall be construed to prohibit the Parties from
28 agreeing to modify any provision of this Order or seeking relief from the Court. Nor

1 shall anything in this Order or any Party's compliance herewith be construed as a
2 waiver of any Party's rights under applicable law.

3
4 **STIPULATED AND AGREED TO on May 15, 2023.**

5 **BLEICHMAR FONTI AND AULD LLP**

6 By: /s/ Lesley E. Weaver

7 Lesley E. Weaver (SBN 191305)
lweaver@bfalaw.com
8 Joshua D. Samra (SBN 313050)
jsamra@bfalaw.com
9 555 12th Street, Suite 1600
10 Oakland, CA 94607
11 Telephone: (415) 445-4003
12 Facsimile: (415) 445-4020

13 **EDELSBERG LAW, P.A.**

14 Scott Edelsberg (SBN 330990)
scott@edelsberglaw.com
15 1925 Century Park E #1700
16 Los Angeles, California 90067
17 Telephone: (310) 438-5355

18 **KOPELOWITZ OSTROW
FERGUSON WEISELBERG
GILBERT**

19 Kristen Lake Cardoso (SBN 338762)
20 cardoso@kolawyers.com
Jeff Ostrow (admitted *pro hac vice*)
21 ostrow@kolawyers.com
22 One West Las Olas, Suite 500
23 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301
24 Telephone: (954) 525-4100
25 Facsimile: (954) 525-4300

26 **GORDON & PARTNERS, P.A.**

27 Steven G. Calamus (admitted *pro hac vice*)
scalamusa@fortheinjured.com
Geoff S. Stahl (admitted *pro hac vice*)

gstahl@fortheinjured.com
Rachel A. Bentley (admitted *pro hac vice*)
rbentley@fortheinjured.com
4114 Northlake Boulevard
Palm Beach Gardens, FL 33410
Telephone: (561) 799-5070
Facsimile: (561) 799-4050

LAW OFFICE OF DENNIS O. COHEN, PLLC

Dennis O. Cohen (admitted *pro hac vice*)
dennis@denniscohenlaw.com
157 13th Street
Brooklyn, NY 11215
Telephone: (646) 859-8855

Attorneys for Plaintiffs and the Proposed Classes

By: /s/ Vincent Galvin
Vincent Galvin
Bowman and Brooke LLP
Vincent.galvin@bowmanandbrooke.com
1741 Technology Drive, Suite 200
San Jose, CA 95110

Kevin Minnick
Spertus Landes & Josephs LLP
kminnick@spertuslaw.com
617 West 7th Street, Suite 200
Los Angeles, CA 90017

*Attorneys for Defendant
Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc.*

ATTESTATION

Pursuant to Local Rule 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i), the e-filing counsel attests that all other signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is jointly submitted, concur in the filing's content, and have authorized the filing.

Dated: May 15, 2023

/s/ *Lesley E. Weaver*

Lesley E. Weaver

1 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

2 DATED: 5/16/2023

3 /s/ Charles F. Eick

4

Honorable Charles F. Eick
5 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Attachment A

Nondisclosure Agreement

I, _____, do solemnly swear that I am fully familiar with the terms of the Stipulated and [Proposed] Protective Order Concerning Confidential Treatment of Discovery Materials entered in *Elliot Nazos, et al. v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc.*, United States District Court for the Central District of California, Civil Action No. CV 2:22-cv-02214-PA(Ex), and hereby agree to comply with and be bound by the terms and conditions of said Order unless and until modified by further Order of the Court. I hereby consent to the jurisdiction of the Court for purposes of enforcing this nondisclosure agreement.

DATED:

[Name of Signator Typed]